

Atmospheric Citizenship Sonic Movement and Public Religion in Shi'i Mumbai

PATRICK EISENLOHR

Urbanity and urban belonging not only are approachable in terms of architectural and population density, patterns of consumption, or nodes of global capital flows, but also often manifest themselves as specific urban atmospheres. These are related to visual, sonic, and olfactory impressions that convey the mystique and feeling of being in the city. Being able to understand and contextualize these sensory impressions enables the urban dweller to successfully navigate the city, and mastery to do so across the internal boundaries of a highly segmented and residentially segregated postcolonial city constitutes a prized kind of knowledge, giving those in command of it a specific “urban charisma” (Hansen and Verkaaik 2009). But urban atmospheres, a main topic of this essay, do not just emerge through sensory impressions and their interplay, but also involve a somatic dimension of bodily encounter and immersion. Such atmospheres are holistic gestalten that cannot be fully reduced to particular sensory perceptions, even if, as in the case discussed here, the auditory plays a central role in the production of urban atmospheres. Following newer approaches in phenomenology, I approach atmospheres as distinct, material entities that bodies encounter and intermingle with.¹ As I will explain below, atmospheres fill spaces as they proceed from persons, objects, or their constellations in events.

I thank my Shi'i interlocutors in Mumbai, above all the staff of World Islamic Network and its director, Imran Rasool, for the support and time they have given to my research. I am also grateful for the comments of Birgit Abels, Matthew Engelke, and the audiences where earlier versions of this essay were presented: at the Urban Futures in Asia conference at Harvard University; at the Institute for Religion, Culture, and Public Life at Columbia University; at the Department of Anthropology and African Studies at the University of Mainz; and at the Department of Social Anthropology at the University of Bern. I also benefited from the comments of Vyjayanthi Rao as well as those of anonymous referees for *Public Culture*. My thanks go to the Netherlands Organization for Scientific Research (NWO) for its generous support.

1. I draw on the phenomenological tradition of theorizing atmospheres as phenomena in their own right since the 1960s (Schmitz 1969, 2014; Böhme 1995). This is distinct from more recent treatments of atmosphere as a variant of affect, such as Kathleen Stewart's (2011: 452) characterization of atmospheres as “lived affect”; see also Ben Anderson's (2009) “affective atmospheres.”

Sonic phenomena can be very concrete exemplifications of atmospheres understood in such terms.

My focus is on sonic atmospheres in Mumbai and their connection to religious practices and forms of belonging. In Mumbai, religious festivals have played a long-standing role in the claiming of urban space. Mumbaikars often conceive such struggles over the right to the city in terms of competing religious communities that also have regional identifications. Religious processions have constituted an important part of this often violent mode of claiming urban space that in Mumbai/Bombay was already notorious and subject to government regulation in the nineteenth century (Masselos 1982; Kaur 2003). There, religious processions, including their intense sonic dimensions (Lynch 2019), turn urban space into places associated with a specific “community” and their moral right to belong to the city, with far-reaching implications regarding housing, employment, and access to public services. This making of urban places is not just a matter of contest between religious communities but often also stands in tension with practices of urban planning and governance in Mumbai, not to speak of the intense competition over urban space and housing that the city has become notorious for (Appadurai 2000). Against the background of a history of intercommunal violence, more recently featuring Hindu nationalist and majoritarian targeting of Muslim minorities in the city and the latter’s progressive ghettoization, the ritual and performative marking of particular urban locales as specifically “Shia Muslim” is a powerful way of publicly claiming and reconfirming the right to be recognized as belonging to Mumbai. Hindu nationalist and Maratha regional chauvinists have in recent years violently rejected such claims.

This in turn raises questions of citizenship, more specifically the problem that “formal membership in the nation-state is increasingly neither a necessary nor a sufficient condition for substantive citizenship” (Holston and Appadurai 1996: 190). The notion of cultural citizenship (Rosaldo 1994) points to the fact that there is no known polity in which legal citizenship is factually decoupled from the performance of ethnic, ethnolinguistic, and religious forms of belonging, or a combination of all above, further reworked through social stratification, even in nation-states that present themselves as highly inclusive, such as India and the United States. With the rise of Hindu nationalist visions of the Indian nation in recent decades, the range of sociocultural elements that falls within the limits of such cultural citizenship has further narrowed. Indian Muslims’ citizenship has become ever more precarious, despite their increasing attempts to justify their citizenship in terms of minority rights (Fazal 2012; Shani 2010; Williams 2012). In everyday life, citizens displaying markers that identify them as Muslims have faced growing difficulty asserting their citizenship, as to many the performance of Muslim identity

has placed them outside the boundaries of the nation, to a position of “abject citizenship” (Sherman 2015: 12). Even among those who do not subscribe to Hindutva ideology, the citizenship of those who are recognizably Muslim is frequently considered conditional. For example, non-Hindutva nationalist discourses have long drawn a distinction between Muslims engaged in shrine-based “syncretic” ritual practice influenced by Sufism that they consider as proper to India, and Muslims who are followers of movements of self-understood Islamic purification. The latter are more likely to be placed outside the boundaries of the nation, despite the centuries-old presence of such traditions within the boundaries of present-day India (Menon 2015; see also Das 1984; Robinson 1983). The notion of atmospheric citizenship I introduce in this essay also starts from the premise that the performance of cultural signs and their ratification by others is central for full inclusion in a nation. However, in contrast to previous formulations of the concept of cultural citizenship (but see Trnka, Dureau, and Park 2013), it places greater stress on the felt dimensions of such citizenship in such performances, highlighting its somatic dimensions that often evade discursive rendering.

Returning to questions of citizenship and belonging in urban settings, such as Mumbai, there is a growing body of research asserting that sound and sonic performance can mark spaces, especially urban spaces, as belonging to a particular group and make a case for their inclusion and belonging, or can be flashpoints for contestations over cultural citizenship. In this struggle over aural borders and the city as “aural borderland” (Western 2020: 297) the Islamic call to prayer (*azan*) is among the most notorious examples (Lee 1999; Tamimi Arab 2017; Weiner 2014), but so can be other Islamic genres, such as broadcast sermons (Eisenberg 2013; Larkin 2014). What is the specific role of sound in accomplishing such links between people, places, and forms of belonging? There is much more to sound than its affordances as a marker, as an indexical or symbolic sign that stands for something, in this case Muslims. Markers need not be sonic in order to do their work of representation, and this raises the question of where the specific sonic contribution to such forms of belonging lies. In order to take sound seriously, one needs to also engage with the proprium of sound—that is, the modalities of knowledge and meaning-making that make it special and that are not reducible to discourse, images, or visual signs. What is it about sound and the sonic that makes it a focal issue in this regard?

My answer is that there is a privileged relationship between the sonic and the emotive that makes it central to urban contests over belonging to a city, and by extension, in my Mumbai example, also belonging to the nation. This is not about resuscitating the tired contrast between supposedly distancing and objectifying visuality—an untenable notion in its own right—and aurality as a domain of inti-

macy and nonseparation, a contrast traceable to Christian theology about spirit and letter that Jonathan Sterne has aptly called an “audio-visual litany” (Sterne 2003: 15–17). There is a privileged link between the sonic and the emotive because the sonic engages the felt-body in a most encompassing way, as it is not just perceived by the hearing apparatus but potentially the entire body, its flesh.² In this, the phenomenological distinction between the felt-body (*Leib*) and the physical body (*Körper*) is important.³ Sonic phenomena are processes of wavelike, vibrational passing of energy through a medium, and these processes often ignore the boundaries between objects, humans, and their nonhuman environments. Several scholars have therefore likened sonic phenomena to affect (Goodman 2010; Shouse 2005).⁴ The workings of sound often appear ineffable to those exposed to them; this is also related to the often-remarked power of particular forms of organized sound like music to profoundly move people in ways they often struggle to describe in words. Here I would like to introduce atmospheres as an analytic to do justice to this proprium of sound. At the same time, atmospheres also allow a new perspective on urban space as something that is felt and provokes particular sensations, sensations that in turn impinge on the crucial urban question to whom that kind of space belongs.

An Atmospheric Right to the City

Much Twelver Shi‘i activism in Mumbai bases its claims for the inclusion of Twelver Shi‘is in the city, and by extension also the Indian nation, on discourse, including

2. The distinction between the sonic, traveling vibratory phenomena, and the acoustic, the limited range of the sonic that humans can perceive with the hearing apparatus, is crucial here. Writing of sonic rather than acoustic atmospheres, I emphasize the ways in which atmospheres can seize and intermingle with the felt-body in ways that exceed the sense of hearing. The notion of flesh also evokes the work of Maurice Merleau-Ponty (1968: 148), who used it to describe the body’s doubling as both sentient and sensible, and its consequent intermingling with the world when, in the case of one hand touching the other, the body touches the body as an other, and feels being touched by it, or when the body utters vocal sound and senses one’s own voice uttering. From this, he draws the following conclusion: “That means that my body is made of the same flesh as the world (it is a perceived), and moreover that this flesh of my body is shared by the world . . . (the felt [*sentit*] at the same time the culmination of subjectivity and the culmination of materiality), they are in a relation of transgression or of overlapping” (Merleau-Ponty 1968: 248). The flesh here stands for the fundamental overlap and entanglement of body and world, of which the perception of the sonic is a prime example.

3. This distinction goes back to Helmuth Plessner ([1925] 1982) and was taken up by Edmund Husserl and Merleau-Ponty. The neo-phenomenologist Hermann Schmitz (2014: 31–32, 83–84) takes the felt-body (*Leib*) to reach beyond the boundaries of the physical body, comprising what is felt to pertain to the body beyond its conventional limits. The notion of the felt-body is useful for an understanding of how sonic phenomena intermingle with bodies.

4. For a critique, see Eisenlohr 2018: 124–28. See also Maria Frederika Malmström’s (2019: 57–69) work on how sonic vibration provokes affective states in recent political upheaval in Cairo.

religious narrative.⁵ But the “live” Muharram processions also contribute to the Shi‘i claim to a right to the city in a different way, even though they certainly also involve discourse and images. Their sonic aspects and their quality of dynamic movement are crucial in this respect. The drumming, the rhythmic breast-beating, the amplified chanting of *nauha*, a genre of poetic lament for the martyrs of Karbala, along with the dynamic movement of bodies and ritual objects through the streets, combine to emit a palpable atmosphere that gives the neighborhoods through which the procession passes a certain Shi‘i quality in nondiscursive ways. This spreading of the quality of being “Shia” is not just an arbitrary, symbolic marker.⁶ It is about a collective experience of suggestions of motion exerted by sounds and the actual movement of people and objects through a neighborhood. While this evokes the work of Henri Lefebvre, both his notion of the right to the city (Lefebvre 1968) as well as his work on rhythmanalysis (Lefebvre 2004), I suggest that neo-phenomenological approaches to atmospheres are more useful in order to understand bodily felt qualities of city neighborhoods that go beyond what can be discursively specified. Here I draw on an understanding of atmospheres as energetic forces that fill spaces and act on felt-bodies, as formulated by philosophers Hermann Schmitz and Gernot Böhme. According to them, atmospheres blur the boundaries between subjects, as well as the boundaries between subjects and their nonhuman environments. Atmospheres are not interior moods but “ecstasies of the thing” (Böhme 1993: 110), material phenomena exuding from persons, objects, and their constellations, that in turn intermingle with sentient bodies. According to Schmitz, atmospheres are the “occupying of a nondimensional space or area within the range of experienced presence” (Schmitz 2014: 30). One reason why atmospheres are important is their emotive qualities; they lend a diffuse and holistic “feel” to situations and environments. According to Schmitz, emotions are not a matter of subjective interiority, but atmospheres are themselves emotions as they spread and fill spaces and touch and become entangled with feeling bodies: “Emotions are atmospheres poured out spatially” (Schmitz, Müllan, and Slaby 2011: 255), they move the feeling body (247), and their perception through somatic mingling with them is similar to feelings of warmth, cold, being under the weather, feeling pain, or being immersed in sound. Atmospheres are palpable through the subtle suggestions of motion they exert on those intermingling with them (Schmitz 2014: 85). Drawing on recent work on

5. Among the most significant actors of such activism in Mumbai is the Twelver Shi‘i media center World Islamic Network; see Eisenlohr 2015a; Mirza 2014; and below.

6. I here use the term *symbol* in a Peircean fashion, as a sign relationship established by social convention (in distinction from icons and indices).

music, sound, and atmospheres (Abels 2013, 2017, 2018; see also Eisenlohr 2018; Riedel 2015), I suggest that sonic events and the flow of bodies as in the Muharram processions are very tangible exemplifications of such suggestions of motion that those exposed to them feel. They are modifications of the felt space of the body that provoke emotions. When such atmospheres fill urban space, as in the unfolding of the Muharram processions, with their sounds of mournful poetry, the sounds of rhythmic self-flagellation with blades fastened to chains and breast-beating, drumming, and the dynamic flow of masses of black-clad participants pressing through the streets, carrying large and elaborately decorated ritual objects linked to the events at Karbala such as *alam* (ornate battle standards with signs of the family of the Prophet) and *tazia* (decorated replicas of the tomb of Hussain and other martyred imams), they exude a feel that lingers on and pertains to a city neighborhood. Such an atmospheric feel of a neighborhood is akin to what Schmitz has called “internally diffuse meaningfulness,” an excess and plurality of meanings that are holistic and inexhaustible and blend into each other to such a degree that they are hard to specify (Schmitz 2014: 53). Therein lies the palpable “feel” of a neighborhood as “Shia” that can never be verbally described in an exhaustive way. Its diffuse holism conveys the feel of a neighborhood as something difficult to render into language, but as an undeniable presence. Video and audio recordings of the Muharram processions and the events linked to them, such as *majalis* (assemblies where devotional and mourning poetry are recited and chanted) on the days preceding the processions, circulate very widely in Mumbai and are nowadays posted on online video portals and shared online. Part of the appeal of such recordings is their affordance and invitation to relive the ritual events or to witness them in a multisensorial way even though one did not participate in them at the time and place of recording. This also includes their atmospheric qualities that can be conveyed to some extent, especially in their sonic dimensions.

The undeniable presence of an urban atmosphere like the one created by the Muharram processions cannot be argued away, because it operates on the nondiscursive level of somatic evidence. It therefore constitutes a powerful register for making claims to the city, alongside the affirmation of Shi'i belonging to the city through discourse and imagery. Such emotional and felt aspects of belonging are often highly consequential, even as they are difficult to describe in a precise way. Despite the fact that such atmospheres can be created, recreated, and manufactured, and even reproduced through media practices (Eisenlohr 2018), there is an air of facticity and givenness about them. They constitute a kind of evidence for belonging that is felt in the flesh and that is largely immune to discursive critique.

The Atmosphere of Muharram Processions

Muharram ritual in Mumbai, as elsewhere, is geared to the production of pious emotions. Its spectacular and sometimes also bloody dimensions have long been the focus of controversy, with Twelver Shi'i Muslims disagreeing about the ways and extent to which the mourning for and the memory of the tragic events at Karbala should find expression in ritual practice. My interlocutors in Mumbai often spoke about a contrast between "rational" and "emotional" ways to commemorate the tragedy of Karbala. This is related to changes in the interpretation of Karbala since the Iranian Revolution, when an earlier quietist emphasis of traditional mourning practices was complemented and sometimes replaced by an activist commitment to political and social improvement in the here and now (cf. Deeb 2009). Among Mumbai Twelver Shi'i Muslims, both tendencies persist; however, many among the younger generation are often attracted to bringing about reform in the field of education and social reform that they view as modern and progressive. As Abbas, a young man in his twenties, told me, "To be a Shia does no longer mean to cry and be a victim. We can make life in the community better, such as through efforts in education and health care." This newer sense of agency and mastery over one's own fate so typical of the post-revolutionary and activist interpretation of the message of Karbala was also central to local Twelver Shi'i media activism (Eisenlohr 2015a: 696–97). In fact, several of my interlocutors linked the emergence of activist engagement with the memory of Karbala to the influence of the Iranian Revolution. In particular, a local media center known as World Islamic Network (WIN) seeks to balance the prevalence of established forms of ritual commemoration in its programming with "modern, rational" television programs geared to a younger audience. These include news programs in a sleek studio setting commenting on world news from an Islamic perspective, or talk show and call-in programs such as *Masael-e zindagi*, where a maulana answers from a Shi'i perspective a broad range of questions posed by viewers calling in or sending messages via online chat and email. As the director of WIN stressed, "Young people are more educated and they want to be given reasons. They will ask [a maulana], 'Why are you saying this, where is your reference?'"

Others continued to defend the established ritual practices, such as the Muharram processions and the dramatic displays of mourning that played on the emotions of everyone present. When I debated differences among Twelver Shi'i customs during Muharram worldwide with Parvez, a middle-aged businessman, I mentioned that the government of the Islamic Republic of Iran as well as Hezbollah in Lebanon had banned bloodletting during Muharram processions, urging people to

donate blood instead. He said that he thought that Indian Shi'is were very emotional. "They will become angry if you tell them not to do this, they will say, you have no right, you are a Wahhabi. You do not know if Imam Hussain will accept it or not, so why do you interfere?" He told me that his own son had engaged in self-flagellation with blades in a procession in the suburb of Bandra, which has a small middle-class Twelver Shi'i population. "He had to have fifty stitches on his head," Parvez said, and from the way he told me about his son's participation in these controversial ritual activities, his disapproval was evident. For others, however, there was no doubt about their beneficial and pious nature; it was an important way to show empathy and emotional intensity in the face of injustice, according to a logic of witnessing (see also Eisenlohr 2015b: 293). The "message" of Karbala was to be reenacted through ritual practice, bringing about a purifying effect through experiencing and provoking overwhelming emotions. To most of my interlocutors, however, the way in which this provoking of emotions unfolds was difficult to put in words. Talking about the broadcast devotional poetry such as dirges for the martyrs of Karbala, Afsar, who worked in a bakery business, told me that "not only the words of the poetry, but the sound of it makes you cry. The sound of it causes crying." But, like others, he found the precise ways in which such sonic events cause strong emotions that make one cry hard to render into discourse. The seeming ineffability of the nexus of sound, emotions, and their pious and purifying effects from a Shi'i perspective was also evident in conversations with ritual specialists. At the fringes of the main afternoon procession on Muharram 10, which that year fell in December 2010, I joined Baqer, a young aspiring maulana whose parents had migrated from Azamgarh in North India to Mumbai before he was born. He had spent two years studying at a Twelver Shi'i seminary in the Iranian holy city of Qom and spoke to me about how much he missed Iran, where two of his children were born, and especially his visits to the shrine of Imam Reza in Mashhad. From Iran, he was also able to go on pilgrimages to Karbala and Najaf. The sound of the devotional poetry, he said, reminded him of his pilgrimages. With these sounds recreating an atmosphere of both the pilgrimage and the events at Karbala, he said that he could not find words to describe the feelings they provoked. With eyes wide open and emotion in his voice, he told me how he had always wanted to travel to these Iraqi holy cities, and was barely able to believe it when he finally reached them. Also for Baqer, the felt aspects of these experiences in which sounds, memory of the pilgrimage, the tragic events of Karbala, and their commemoration and partial reenactment that we were witnessing blended into each other, giving the situation an overarching feel, and seeming to evade discourse.

The main procession on the afternoon of Muharram 10 moves through Dongri,

the historic heart of Twelver Shi'i Bombay/Mumbai, and also from Dongri to the Rahmatabad cemetery in Mazagaon. Dongri is not an exclusively Shi'i neighborhood; the neighborhood and its adjacent areas are home to a great diversity of other people such as Sunni Muslims and Hindus of different backgrounds. The tense sharing of streets and other urban space that characterizes the procession is iconic of the situation of Twelver Shi'i Muslims in the city at large, where they face an array of contesting claims of belonging (Gupta 2015). As far as the procession is concerned, some Sunni Muslims have strong anti-Shi'i tendencies and reject the massive public ritual spectacles in commemoration of the events at Karbala in the month of Muharram. Added to this, there is the internal fragmentation of Shi'i Muslims in the city, with distinctions of sect, ethnicity, and class separating Bohra and Khoja Ismaeli communities of Gujarati trader background from the Twelver Shi'i, who are in their majority of North Indian origin and overwhelmingly poor. However, there is also marked diversity and stratification among Twelver Shi'i Muslims, as two trader communities among them, the Ithna Ashari Khojas of Gujarati origin and the "Mughals," whose ancestors migrated to Bombay from Qajar Persia in the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, play the role of social and economic elites who also control most Twelver Shi'i institutions in the city. This contested and fragmented quality of the urban terrain only heightens the stakes for performing claims to belong to the city through the Muharram processions, including their sensory and atmospheric dimensions. In fact, the sidelining of such ordinary social boundaries and the downplaying of conventional discourses of citizenship that the sensory and atmospheric aspects of the ritual spectacle bring about crucially enable the staging of such claims to the city.

Among the participants, many express their mourning by wearing black clothes. The processions are an exercise in sensory intensity, for which acoustemologies, ways of knowing and engaging with human and environmental worlds through sound and sounding (Feld 1996), are central. On the morning of the procession, the harsh sounds of pedal-powered grindstones sharpening the long razor blades fastened to chains to be used for ritual and rhythmic self-flagellation can be heard in the street in front of the Mughal Masjid, a main Twelver Shi'i mosque originally built by Iranian traders in the heart of Dongri. Together with the smell of metal dust in the air, they emit a visceral feel of expected events and actions in the afternoon. Groups of devout Shi'is, often organized in clubs and guilds named for the places of origin from where their families migrated to Mumbai, carry highly decorated tazia, along with tall, ornate alam. Often, blood-smearred shrouds are fastened to the standards as a dramatic sign of the mourning, suffering, and martyrdom at Karbala. Groups of men with bare upper bodies engage in bloody and spectacular acts of self-flagellation

FIGURE 1 Blades for sale in Dongri on the morning of Ashura. Photograph by the author.



FIGURE 2 Tazia in Dongri. Photograph by the author.



known as *zanjiri matam*, with knives or sharp razor blades fastened to chains with which they keep hitting their backs. In some locations, participants restage the events at Karbala, literally reliving and positioning themselves as witnesses of the tragic events. The rhythmic, amplified chanting of devotional poetry can be heard throughout, expressing grief and pain and sometimes narrating the traumatic events at Karbala and the suffering of the family of the Prophet in heartrending detail. The sounds of large groups of men beating their breasts in unison while chanting dirges in a show of bereavement mingle with the sounds of drummers that move through the streets (cf. Wolf 2000), heightening the emotional intensity of the spectacle. As a whole, the processions are a highly dynamic event; they are an expression of rhythm and bodily movement, a point to which I will return.

Consider the sequences and layering of sounds in a recording I made of the main procession on the afternoon of Muharram 10 from Dongri to Mazagaon in December 2010. The recording starts with rhythmic chants of “ya Hussain” by men carrying decorated alam with shrouds fastened to them, walking through a side street en route to the main procession. This is followed by a scene of a group of young men and adolescents with bare upper bodies engaging in *zanjiri matam*. The metallic sounds of chains and blades merge with the thumping sounds of the metal implements hitting the bleeding backs of the devotees in unison, as they are egged on by calls from the bystanders surrounding them on the street. Another signature sound of the procession by bodily acts of mourning is the clapping sound of men rhythmically beating their breasts with their hands or fists in a show of bereavement, driven on by calls of “Ali, Ali” (Hussain’s father and the son-in-law of the Prophet). A cart with a sound system passes by, blaring out the refrain of a dirge in a lamenting voice: “sham ho gayi, sham ho gayi” (evening has come). The lament evokes the mood of the evening of the battle of Karbala (*sham-e ghariban*), when the martyrs had been slain and darkness and despair descended on the survivors among the family of the Prophet. This poetically and sonically evoked scene is a long-established and frequently recurring focus of emotions in Shi’i commemorations of the tragic events at Karbala. Interlayered with the recited lament are the sounds of ambulances’ horns and the loud whistles blown by paramedics as they try to clear a way for the emergency vehicles through the crowd. Not all, but many of the patients in the ambulances are injured mourners who, having fainted, are on the way to the hospital, adding to the feel of drama and tragic urgency that the spectacular acts of the bereavement and their vocal poetic renderings literally spread through the streets. The scene then shifts again to a collective act of self-flagellation, with its telltale metallic sounds of the chains’ and blades’ impacting each other, mingled with the audible hitting of sharp metal instruments on flesh.

Periodically recurring religious processions like the Muharram processions in Mumbai achieve the production of urban places and forms of belonging connected to them, not just because of the movement of bodies through streets and other public locations, but also through the creation of particular sonic atmospheres that convey impressions of one neighborhood having the “feel” of belonging to a certain community rather than others. The Muharram procession is central to a “process of acoustic *territorialization*” (Labelle 2010: xxiii), making a Mumbai neighborhood Shi’i. The rhythmic beating of breasts and the chanting of various slogans and genres of poetry lamenting the martyrdom of Hussain; the broadcasting, mediatic recirculation and public amplification of sermons, intermingled with the sound of ambulances catering to fainted mourners engaging in bloody forms of self-flagellation; the sound of hundreds of razor blades being ground and sharpened beforehand; and the metallic sound of the chains they are fastened to during flagellation, contribute some of the key sonic components marking the south central neighborhood of Dongri and surrounding areas as specifically “Shia.” This shows how urban places such as neighborhoods are both produced and known through experiences that bring about urbanity as a felt quality, here in particular the creation of sonic atmospheres as feelings.

Sonically induced suggestions of motion are the somatic end of a continuum of motion that generates territoriality and belonging through repeated movement. At the other end are the observable movements of bodies and ritual objects through the streets of South Central Mumbai, tracing an established route from Dongri to the Rahmatabad cemetery in Mazagaon (Masoudi Nejad 2015), marking and reconstituting this part of the city as a focus of Shi’i Muslim belonging. Such belonging is reinforced and most powerfully emerges in the interplay between different modes of motion and mobility, such as recurring travel and pilgrimage of persons, the movement of people and sacred objects through the streets, and finally the subtle suggestions of motion that sonic atmospheres exude. The Muharram processions in Mumbai show us how this entire spectrum from transnational travel and pilgrimage down to palpable sonic suggestions of motion is involved in making territories, places, and sites of belonging. These acts of motion in turn vitally contribute to the nondiscursive constitution of citizenship. Their atmospheric dimensions give such belonging an air of somatic facticity.

Urban Atmospheres

Atmospheres as “ecstasies of the thing” have become a theme in scholarship on cities. Those interested in the aesthetic and affective dimensions of urban places have



FIGURE 3 Afternoon procession on Ashura, moving from Dongri to Mazagaon. Photograph by the author.



FIGURE 4 Afternoon procession on Ashura, moving from Dongri to Mazagaon. Photograph by the author.

been spurred by the suggestion that “urbanity has an atmospheric core” (Hasse 2014: 185; my translation). Atmospheres as feelings extended in space profoundly affect persons, just as being in warmth or darkness does, shaping a sense of being in the city. In cities, a plurality of atmospheres coexist and overlap, in often contradictory and complex ways. Urbanity is palpable through immersion in atmospheres, and the very literal felt-bodily encounter with them. Architecture (Böhme 2006), sets of illumination (Edensor 2012), smells, the movement of people and vehicles, and also urban sounds can all exude feelings of urbanity as atmospheres. According to Schmitz, atmospheres are “half-things,” phenomena that are fleeting and immersive, such as sounds and rainstorms that disappear and return (Schmitz 2014: 74–75). Frequently, those affected by an atmosphere resort to synesthetic descriptors to report their experience, such as when describing a city as “lively.” Furthermore, residents can identify and locate particular neighborhoods of a city through their atmosphere, while contemporary urban planners also deploy the atmospheric character of a neighborhood in marketing strategies and even aim at manufacturing atmospheres in the construction of new neighborhoods, as in Hamburg’s “HafenCity,” a new part of the city built on the site of former port warehouses dating from the nineteenth century (Hasse 2014: 257–58). This line of work on urban atmospheres in philosophy and geography is highly relevant for my discussion of the atmospheric dimensions of the Shi’i character of Dongri as a distinct Mumbai neighborhood. In contrast to most previous studies of urban atmospheres, my investigation focuses on the sonic rather than architecture and illumination as generators of atmospheres. I suggest that the sonic creation of a specific character of Dongri tied to its Shi’i history mainly becomes palpable in two ways, or steps, the first more general, the second more specific.

First, the sounds that emerge from the procession, whether the repetition of slogans, the sound of rhythmic breast-beating, the devotional genres of recited poetry commemorating the events of Karbala, or the sounds of metal chains and blades used during flagellation have one quality in common: they are sounds of rhythmic movement, they comprise an alternation between strong and weak elements on multiple dimensions. This is plainly obvious in the case of breast-beating, the repetition of slogans, and the flagellation with metal implements. But also the musical rendering of commemorative and mournful poetry of the nauha genre shares this quality of rhythmic, here musical, vocal movement. These sonic manifestations are ecstasies of the procession, which itself is a movement of bodies and ritual objects through the city. The sounds of collective movement emanating from the procession have a capacity to seize and affect those exposed to them. Returning to the theme of sonically generated atmospheres, in this context it is useful to

draw a link to Hermann Schmitz's (2014: 85) suggestion that atmospheres are not just feelings poured into a pre-dimensional space, but also suggestions of motion, an insight that resonates with Böhme's (2000: 16) point that sound as atmosphere acts through modifying space as it is experienced by the body. In other words, those affected by sounds like those emerging from the procession do not just hear movement, but their felt-bodies are also touched and immersed in a way suggesting or driving toward analogous motion. Through sound, suggestions of motion work on the felt-bodies of those witnessing the performance. These sonic movements are a chief means of making the specific urban atmosphere of Dongri as a Shi'i neighborhood perceivable as a socially shared experience, as a mode of intercorporeality (Csordas 2008). Atmospheres become shared and social through processes of encorporation, which is how I translate Hermann Schmitz's (2014: 59) term *Einleibung*. Especially in the case of sonic atmospheres acting out the same suggestions of movement on a multitude of felt-bodies, the felt-bodies that encounter such an atmosphere can temporarily become part of a larger collective entity in which the boundaries between them become permeable, so that they constitute a supra-felt-body or *we-Leib*. Atmospheres therefore are able to create a collective feeling of being in and being part of a shared emotionally charged space.

But the sonic atmospheres generated in the procession also produce the shared experiential Shi'i character of Dongri in a second, more specific way. The sounds of breast-beating, flagellation, the slogans invoking members of the family of the Prophet, along with the amplified recitation of devotional poetry, bring together those familiar with the narrative of Karbala as a community of witnesses. In other words, the shared emotional space that the process of atmospheric encorporation I just mentioned creates, and that is atmospheric in its diffuse meaningfulness, is in this second step further qualified as specifically Shi'i. Witnessing, in both Islamic as well as Christian traditions, is intimately linked to martyrdom. This entanglement of witnessing and martyrdom is to a large extent based on assumed inner connections between pain, death, and truth that also provide the background to the history of judicial uses of torture in Europe (Peters 2001: 711–15), while in Islamic traditions, *shahid* refers to both martyr and witness. The restaging of events that happened at Karbala during the procession, where sonic and visual reminders of Karbala are thickly present, summons those receptive to the Karbala paradigm as witnesses of the events, thus collectively tying them to the unfolding spectacle. As John Durham Peters (2001: 708) has put it in his discussion of media and witnessing: "to witness an event is to be responsible in some way to it." Witnessing and reliving the mournful events of Karbala is the common theme of many ritual practices of Shi'ism, and it features prominently among my interlocutors as signs of what they

referred to as a “good Shia.” Witnessing is an inherently social act and, elaborated as a religious performance, can be constitutive of community. Sonic atmospheres proceeding from the procession help to achieve a rapprochement of a collective of listeners—that is, those affected by the sonic events in the knowledge that the sounds of the events also affect others at the same time—with a Shi‘i community of pious witnesses of Karbala. It is through the body and sensations felt through it, such as sorrow and pain, that witnessing occurs: “The body is authenticity’s last refuge in situations of structural doubt” (Peters 2001: 717).

As sonic atmospheres affect the body through their suggestions of motion, they play a powerful role in positioning listeners in the role of witnesses. They thus reinforce the memory and narrative of Karbala by giving the impression of firsthand experience through their affection of bodies. They thereby affirm the moral truths the events have come to stand for among Shi‘is, and sometimes even non-Shi‘is, including also some non-Muslims. To a large extent this involves sounds coming from painful and mournful events and acts such as breast-beating, flagellation with sharp metal implements, and amplified, sorrowful poetry. In a very literal way, these sounds constitute an atmosphere, and therefore a feel of the events and the narrative of Karbala. As periodically recurring urban atmospheres, they contribute to giving the urban setting a specifically Shi‘i feel that is as diffuse as it is powerful. The hailing and summoning of listeners as witnesses through the sounds of the performance establishes a connection between the atmosphere of the urban locale and specifically Shi‘i narratives and moral stances.

Territorialization, Travel, and Sonic Movement

As much as the sonic movements discussed here contribute to Shi‘i belonging in the urban setting of Mumbai, they also have important translocal aspects that interact with other, more visual reminders of the battle of Karbala around whose memory the procession revolves. The commemorative processions contain elements of reenacting the events at Karbala, in a sense transporting the devotees to this sacred site in present-day Iraq. It is well known that the events of the battle of Karbala in 680 CE play a pivotal role in Shi‘i self-understanding and religious orientation. Scholars have referred to the “Karbala paradigm” (Fischer 1980; Korom 2002), centered on a narrative and images of resistance, just struggle, and sacrifice against overwhelming odds, as a template of Shi‘ism. Karbala in present-day Iraq, where the pivotal events took place and which is also the site of Hussain’s magnificent tomb, has long been a site of pilgrimage, as is Najaf, a city of Shi‘ite learning and the site of the tomb of Ali, Hussain’s father and son-in-law of the Prophet. Karbala is literally holy ground

for Shi'i Muslims. Karbala and other places of pilgrimage and associated centers of Islamic learning such as Damascus in Syria, and Qom and Mashhad in Iran, have long featured as places of longing and favored destinations of pilgrimage in Shi'i imaginations; material objects from these sites and the experience of being present there evoke deep emotions and feelings of attachment.

But Shi'i Muslims do not just link themselves to Middle Eastern sacred sites in memory of the family of the Prophet; they also perpetuate a tradition of attachment to India as a holy land. For example, among Shi'i Muslims in Mumbai there are discourses of aligning Imam Hussain's example at Karbala with Gandhi's freedom struggle in India (see Hyder 2006), suggesting that the latter was directly inspired by the former. In 2007 a religious advertising campaign by the Mumbai Twelver Shi'i media center World Islamic Network (WIN), announced under the name "Muharram Awareness Campaign" in the sacred month of Muharram, prominently showcased an alleged quote by Gandhi, "If India ever desires to be a great nation, it should follow the example of Imam Hussain." Also, longstanding discourses circulate among Shi'i Muslims according to which Hussain intended to go and settle in India, emphasizing the great respect accorded to India as a site of learning and wisdom in Islamic traditions and sayings of members of the family of the Prophet (Eisenlohr 2015a: 699–701).

In the specific Shi'i ritual context I have described, sonically enacted movements affect listeners in such a way that both the making of an urban neighborhood as distinctly Shi'i as well as forms of transoceanic belonging are strengthened in deeply emotional ways. Here, the surrogate character of the procession as a pilgrimage is centrally important. The ability to recognize and locate such sounds, an acoustemology in Feld's sense, is not only an important means of navigating the city in its great diversity, because such sounds also contain specific pointers to locations beyond its boundaries. In the ritual setting, the sounds evoking the tragedy of Karbala evoke not just profound sorrow and grieving, reinforcing a Shi'i claim on a part of Mumbai, but also momentarily transport attuned listeners to a witness position in a distant location in nondiscursive ways, going beyond the narrative construction of Shi'i tradition. The performative establishment of links to places in other parts of the world, far beyond the city's boundaries, does not contradict the efforts of acoustic territorialization that support a Shi'i belonging in Mumbai. On the contrary, the evocation of Karbala and other places in present-day Iraq, Iran, and Syria reinforces such a project, as "acoustic territories should not be exclusively read as places or sites but more as *itineraries*, as points of departure as well as arrival" (Labelle 2010: xxv). The notion of territorialization as travel, including its sonic dimensions, plays a crucial role in positioning those present at the procession as witnesses of the events

at Karbala, thereby supporting a specifically Shi'i historical memory. It also speaks to the position of Twelver Shi'i Muslims as people whose lives are organized around intersections of various forms of mobility, as a prime example of the social processes and organizations that have been discussed in the recent literature on a "mobilities paradigm" (Adey 2010; Sheller and Urry 2006; Urry 2007). My point is that these mobilities do not just comprise actual migration within India, as the great majority of Twelver Shi'i Muslims in Mumbai are migrants or the descendants of migrants from North India who continue to maintain close links to their places of ancestral origin they often refer to as *vatan* (homeland) (Eisenlohr 2015c). Associations (*anjuman*) of those sharing a *vatan* elsewhere in India play a major role in organizing Muharram ritual in Mumbai, including the commemorative processions. Nor are these mobilities limited to circuits of labor migration to countries of the Persian Gulf, that Shi'is are engaged in along with other Muslims in Mumbai (Hansen 2001). They also go beyond actual pilgrimages to the sacred sites of Twelver Shi'ism in Iraq and Iran. Muharram processions in Mumbai do not just build on and point to all these forms of mobility and fold them together with movement of bodies and ritual objects through urban streets; they also interweave them with the somatically felt motion of the procession's sounds. That is, they enact a large complex of interlaced motion on a cline stretching from transnational migration and pilgrimage, migration, and travel within India, via recurring forms of travel through an urban setting, to the atmospheric suggestions of motion that the sonic aspects of ritual processions enact on felt-bodies.⁷ These atmospheric suggestions of motion provide somatic evidence for both far-flung connections and the making of urban places as "Shia," thereby undergirding claims of belonging to the city.

In this way, religious networks and traditions play a key role in sustaining a sense of attachment across the Indian Ocean, with both India and particular religions and sites in the Middle East as foci of belonging and emotionally charged affiliation, highlighting the sensory and material dimensions of belonging that constitute "emotional geographies" (Anderson and Smith 2001). Certainly, long traditions of narration provide a key foundation for translocal Shi'i attachments to holy lands and places in India and beyond, resulting in transoceanic forms of belonging. However, especially in pilgrimage and commemorative rituals, such attachments

7. This resonates with Tim Cresswell's (2006: 123–45) call for an integrated account of human mobilities ranging from long-distance migration, transport infrastructures, to the politics of bodily mobility, which in his research also involve the regimentation and policing of dance steps traveling across the Atlantic. "My aim, then, is to provide a way of thinking that traces some of the processes that run through the different accounts of human mobility at different scales, and ties them into a single logic without negating the very important differences between them" (7).

also emerge as the result of exposure to material sites and environments that affect pious Shi'i Muslims in bodily ways that involve, but cannot be reduced to, the workings of discourse. Sonic atmospheres can be a chief mode for the creation of such attachments.

Conclusion

In this essay I have tried to make a case for the centrality of sonic atmospheres in the constitution of cultural citizenship. Trying to show how sonic practices and performances help to produce the feel of a Mumbai neighborhood as belonging to Twelver Shi'is, I have highlighted the somatic dimensions of belonging to certain places. If cultural citizenship “refers to the right to be different . . . with respect to the dominant national community, without compromising one's right to belong” (Rosaldo 1994: 57), the articulation of such claims does not merely involve atmospheric and felt aspects. Atmospheres, including sonic atmospheres, can be of critical importance in contexts where the conventional boundaries of citizenship discourse and powerful counterclaims over contested urban space make the successful articulation of such rights for inclusion and belonging highly challenging. At the same time, Mumbai Twelver Shi'i place-bound belonging is intertwined and produced by an array of mobilities including migration, pilgrimage, and ritual processions that also include sonic movement. The sonic is a privileged avenue for investigating such nondiscursive and bodily felt aspects of citizenship and belonging because of its intimate relationship with felt-bodies. In exerting collectively felt suggestions of motion, sonic events and performances produce feelings, thereby bringing about an atmospheric, prediscursive sense of place. The sonic dimensions of a regularly recurring religious procession are a vital component of such making of place, interacting with other kinds of mobility. Their bodily felt character invests such place-bound belonging with an air of facticity, foregrounding nondiscursive, somatic evidence for claims of citizenship with far-reaching consequences.

Patrick Eisenlohr is professor of anthropology with a chair in society and culture in modern India at the Centre for Modern Indian Studies at the University of Göttingen. His latest book is *Sounding Islam: Voice, Media, and Sonic Atmospheres in an Indian Ocean World* (2018). His work examines the relationships between religion, language, and media, the sonic dimensions of religion, as well as the links between media practices and citizenship.

References

- Abels, Birgit. 2013. "Hörgemeinschaften: Eine musikwissenschaftliche Annäherung an die Atmosphärenforschung." *Musikforschung* 66, no. 3: 220–31.
- Abels, Birgit. 2017. "Musical Atmospheres and Sea-Nomadic Movement among the Sama Dilaut: Sounding Out a Mobile World." *Mobile Culture Studies* 3, no. 3: 21–36. doi.org/10.25364/08.3:2017.1.2.
- Abels, Birgit. 2018. "Music, Affect, and Atmospheres: Meaning and Meaningfulness in Palauan *omengere-dakl*." *International Journal of Traditional Arts*, no. 2: 1–17.
- Adey, Peter. 2010. *Mobility*. New York: Routledge.
- Anderson, Ben. 2009. "Affective Atmospheres." *Emotion, Space, and Society* 2, no. 2: 77–81.
- Anderson, Kay, and Susan Smith. 2001. "Editorial: Emotional Geographies." *Transactions of the Institute of British Geographers*, n.s., 26, no. 1: 7–10.
- Appadurai, Arjun. 2000. "Spectral Housing and Urban Cleansing: Notes on Millennial Mumbai." *Public Culture* 12, no. 3: 627–51.
- Böhme, Gernot. 1993. "Atmosphere as the Fundamental Concept of a New Aesthetics." *Thesis Eleven* 36, no. 1: 113–26.
- Böhme, Gernot. 1995. *Atmosphäre: Essays zur neuen Ästhetik*. Frankfurt: Suhrkamp.
- Böhme, Gernot. 2000. "Acoustic Atmospheres: A Contribution to the Study of Ecological Aesthetics." *Sound-scape* 1, no. 1: 14–18.
- Böhme, Gernot. 2006. *Architektur und Atmosphäre*. München: Wilhelm Fink.
- Cresswell, Tim. 2006. *On the Move: Mobility in the Modern Western World*. New York: Routledge.
- Csordas, Thomas J. 2008. "Intersubjectivity and Intercorporeality." *Subjectivity* 22, no. 1: 110–21.
- Das, Veena. 1984. "For a Folk-Theology and Theological Anthropology of Islam." *Contributions to Indian Sociology*, n.s., 18, no. 2: 293–300.
- Deeb, Lara. 2009. "Emulating and/or Embodying the Ideal: The Gendering of Temporal Frameworks and Islamic Role Models in Shi'i Lebanon." *American Ethnologist* 36, no. 2: 242–57.
- Edensor, Tim. 2012. "Illuminated Atmospheres: Anticipating and Reproducing the Flow of an Affective Experience in Blackpool." *Environment and Planning D: Society and Space* 30, no. 6: 1103–12.
- Eisenberg, Andrew. 2013. "Islam, Sound, and Space: Acoustemology and Citizenship on the Kenyan Coast." In *Music, Sound, and Space: Transformations of Public and Private Experience*, edited by Georgia Born, 186–202. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Eisenlohr, Patrick. 2015a. "Media, Citizenship, and Religious Mobilization: The Muharram Awareness Campaign in Mumbai." *Journal of Asian Studies* 74, no. 3: 687–710.
- Eisenlohr, Patrick. 2015b. "Mediating Disjunctures of Time: Ancestral Chronotopes in Ritual and Media Practices." *Anthropological Quarterly* 88, no. 2: 281–304.
- Eisenlohr, Patrick. 2015c. "Media, Urban Aspirations, and Religious Mobilization among Twelver Shi'ite Muslims in Mumbai." In *Handbook of Religion and the Asian City: Aspiration and Urbanization in the Twenty-First Century*, edited by Peter van der Veer, 415–31. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Eisenlohr, Patrick. 2018. *Sounding Islam: Voice, Media, and Sonic Atmospheres in an Indian Ocean World*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Fazal, Tanweer. 2012. "Minorities and Their Nationalism(s): The Terms of a Discourse in South Asia." *South Asian History and Culture* 3, no. 2: 163–76.
- Feld, Steven. 1996. "Waterfalls of Song: An Acoustemology of Place Resounding in Bosavi, Papua New Guinea." In *Senses of Place*, edited by Steven Feld and Keith Basso, 91–135. Santa Fe, NM: School of American Research Press.
- Fischer, Michael M. J. 1980. *Iran: From Religious Dispute to Revolution*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- Goodman, Steve. 2010. *Sonic Warfare: Sound, Affect, and the Ecology of Fear*. Cambridge, MA: MIT Press.

- Gupta, Radhika. 2015. "There Must Be Some Way Out of Here: Beyond a Spatial Conception of Muslim Ghettoization in Mumbai?" *Ethnography* 16, no. 3: 352–70.
- Hansen, Thomas B. 2001. "Bridging the Gulf: Migration, Modernity, and Identity among Muslims in Mumbai." In *Community, Empire, and Migration: South Asians in Diaspora*, edited by Crispin Bates, 261–85. Delhi: Orient Longman.
- Hansen, Thomas B., and Oskar Verkaaik. 2009. "Introduction—Urban Charisma: On Everyday Mythologies in the City." *Critique of Anthropology* 29, no. 1: 5–26.
- Hasse, Jürgen. 2014. *Was Räume mit uns machen—und wir mit ihnen: Kritische Phänomenologie des Raumes*. Freiburg: Alber.
- Holston, James, and Arjun Appadurai. 1996. "Cities and Citizenship." *Public Culture* 8, no. 2: 187–204.
- Hyder, Syed Akbar. 2006. *Reliving Karbala: Martyrdom in South Asian Memory*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Kaur, Raminder. 2003. *Performative Politics and the Cultures of Hinduism: Public Uses of Religion in Western India*. London: Anthem.
- Khan, Sameera. 2003. "Muharram in the Mohalla." In *Bombay, meri jaan: Writings on Mumbai*, edited by Jerry Pinto and Naresh Fernandes, 224–34. New Delhi: Penguin.
- Korom, Frank. 2002. *Hosay Trinidad: Muharram Performances in an Indo-Caribbean Diaspora*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press.
- Labelle, Brandon. 2010. *Acoustic Territories: Sound Culture and Everyday Life*. New York: Continuum.
- Larkin, Brian. 2014. "Techniques of Inattention: The Mediality of Loudspeakers in Nigeria." *Anthropological Quarterly* 87, no. 4: 989–1016.
- Lee, Tong Song. 1999. "Technology and the Production of Islamic Space: The Call to Prayer in Singapore." *Ethnomusicology* 43, no. 1: 86–110.
- Lefebvre, Henri. 1968. *Le droit à la ville*. Paris: Anthropos.
- Lefebvre, Henri. 2004. *Rhythmanalysis: Space, Time, and Everyday Life*. London: Continuum.
- Lynch, Julian Anthony. 2019. "Festival 'Noise' and Soundscape Politics in Mumbai, India." *Sound Studies* 5, no. 1: 37–51.
- Malmström, Maria Frederika. 2019. *The Streets Are Talking to Me: Affective Fragments in Sisi's Egypt*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Masoudi Nejad, Reza. 2015. "The Muharram Procession of Mumbai: From Seafront to Cemetery." In *Handbook of Religion and the Asian City: Aspiration and Urbanization in the Twenty-First Century*, edited by Peter van der Veer, 89–109. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Masselos, Jim. 1982. "Change and Custom in the Format of the Bombay Mohurrum in the Nineteenth and Twentieth Centuries." *South Asia* 5, no. 2: 47–67.
- Menon, Nandagopal R. 2015. "Communal Harmony as Governmentality: Reciprocity, Peace-Keeping, State Legitimacy, and Citizenship in Contemporary India." *Modern Asian Studies* 49, no. 2: 393–429.
- Merleau-Ponty, Maurice. 1968. *The Visible and the Invisible*. Evanston, IL: Northwestern University Press.
- Mirza, Shireen. 2014. "Travelling Leaders and Connecting Print Cultures: Two Conceptions of Twelver Shi'i Reformism in the Indian Ocean." *Journal of the Royal Asiatic Society* 24, no. 3: 455–75.
- Peters, John Durham. 2001. "Witnessing." *Media, Culture, and Society* 23, no. 6: 707–23.
- Plessner, Helmuth. (1925) 1982. "Die Deutung des mimischen Ausdrucks: Ein Beitrag zur Lehre vom Bewusstsein des anderen Ichs." In *Gesammelte Schriften*, vol. 7, *Ausdruck und menschliche Natur*, with F. J. Buytendijk, edited by Günter Dux, Odo Marquard, and Elisabeth Ströker, 67–129. Frankfurt: Suhrkamp.
- Riedel, Friedlind. 2015. "Music as Atmosphere: Lines of Becoming in Congregational Worship." *Lebenswelt*, no. 6: 80–111.
- Robinson, Francis. 1983. "Islam and Muslim Society in South Asia." *Contributions to Indian Sociology*, n.s., 17, no. 2: 185–203.

- Rosaldo, Renato. 1994. "Cultural Citizenship in San Jose, California." *PoLAR* 17, no. 2: 57–64.
- Schmitz, Hermann. 1969. *Der Gefühlsraum*. Vol. 3, pt. 2 of *System der Philosophie*. Bonn: Bouvier.
- Schmitz, Hermann. 2014. *Atmosphären*. Freiburg: Alber.
- Schmitz, Hermann, Rudolf Owen Müllan, and Jan Slaby. 2011. "Emotions Outside the Box—the New Phenomenology of Feeling and Corporeality." *Phenomenology and the Cognitive Sciences* 10, no. 2: 241–59.
- Shani, Ornit. 2010. "Conceptions of Citizenship in India and the 'Muslim Question.'" *Modern Asian Studies* 44, no. 1: 145–73.
- Sheller, Mimi, and John Urry. 2006. "The New Mobilities Paradigm." *Environment and Planning A: Economy and Space* 38, no. 2: 207–26.
- Sherman, Taylor C. 2015. *Muslim Belonging in Secular India: Negotiating Citizenship in Postcolonial Hyderabad*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Shouse, Eric. 2005. "Feeling, Emotion, Affect." *M/C Journal* 8, no. 6. journal.media-culture.org.au/0512/03-shouse.php.
- Sterne, Jonathan. 2003. *The Audible Past: Cultural Origins of Sound Reproduction*. Durham, NC: Duke University Press.
- Stewart, Kathleen. 2011. "Atmospheric Attunements." *Environment and Planning D: Society and Space* 29, no. 3: 445–53.
- Tamimi Arab, Pooyan. 2017. *Amplifying Islam in the European Soundscape: Religious Pluralism and Secularism in the Netherlands*. London: Bloomsbury.
- Trnka, Susanna, Christine Dureau, and Julie Park, eds. 2013. *Senses and Citizenships: Embodying Political Life*. London: Routledge.
- Urry, John. 2007. *Mobilities*. Cambridge: Polity.
- Weiner, Isaac A. 2014. "Calling Everyone to Pray: Pluralism, Secularism, and the Adhān in Hamtramck, Michigan." *Anthropological Quarterly* 87, no. 4: 1049–77.
- Western, Tom. 2020. "Listening with Displacement: Sound, Citizenship, and Disruptive Representations of Migration." *Migration and Society: Advances in Research* 3, no. 1: 294–309.
- Williams, Philippa. 2012. "India's Muslims, Lived Secularism, and Realising Citizenship." *Citizenship Studies* 16, no. 8: 979–95.
- Wolf, Richard K. 2000. "Embodiment and Ambivalence: Emotion in South Asian Muharram Drumming." *Yearbook for Traditional Music* 32: 81–116.